Secure Coding.
Practical steps to defend your web apps.

Copyright SANS Institute
Author Retains Full Rights

This paper is from the SANS Software Security site. Reposting is not permitted without express written permission.

Interested in learning more?
Check out the list of upcoming events offering
"Defending Web Applications Security Essentials (DEV522)"
Introduction to the OWASP Mutillidae II Web Pen-Test Training Environment

GIAC (GWAPT) Gold Certification

Author: Jeremy Druin, jdruin@gmail.com

Advisor: Chris Walker

Accepted: October 18th, 2013

Abstract

Web application penetration testing is composed of numerous skills which require “hands on” practice to learn. To prepare for certification exams, master concepts learned in training, and practice pen testing, a deliberately vulnerable web application is needed. While several excellent applications exist, very few provide many types of web application vulnerabilities in a single platform. In particular, having both traditional vulnerabilities plus vulnerable web services in the same platform is rare (Eston, Abraham, & Johnson, 2011). Additionally, features such as automated recovery, built-in hints, and varying levels of difficulty are not found within the same target framework.

The OWASP Mutillidae II Web Pen-Test Training Environment provides an environment to practice exploits against approximately forty documented vulnerabilities. Two vulnerabilities are exposed as web services. Mutillidae II delivers tutorials, supporting videos, and database reset functionality. The system is designed to assist students, exam candidates, and professionals in mastering web application security testing.
1. Introduction

Web application security has become increasingly important to organizations. In 2012, statistics on data breaches show nearly 80% of records taken in data breaches were due to defects in web applications (Verizon RISK Team et al., 2012). Training developers in secure coding and awareness are essential parts of a security program. (The Open Web Application Security Project (OWASP), 2009).

Vulnerable web applications provide a safe, legal target on which aid developers in understanding and appreciating the consequences of the vulnerabilities. Security training instructors can avoid having to create custom web applications since ready-made lab environments are available. Additionally they offer an “apples to apples” testing target for potential web application vulnerability scanners. This is useful to evaluate vendor products against each other and against a target with specific, disclosed vulnerabilities (David Shelly, 2010).

Excellent applications have been provided which offer features a web application training target might implement (Crenshaw, 2009). In order to cover multiple aspects of a security program, a web application should have the following characteristics.

- Present real web, application, web service and database vulnerabilities
- Provide vulnerabilities from multiple versions of OWASP Top Ten (OWASP Foundation, 2010) (OWASP Foundation, 2010), SANS Top 25 (SANS, 2011), and others.
- Require few steps to install
- Run on multiple operating systems
- Require little programming experience to operate
- Recover from attacks
- Includes hints and tutorials
- Run in multiple security levels
- Be free to use and open source
Mutillidae II\(^1\) (Druin, 2011) is a free, open source, deliberately vulnerable web-application target for web-security training. For users who do not want to administer a webserver Mutillidae can be installed on Linux\(^2\) and Windows\(^3\) operating systems\(^4\) using the following platforms.

- LAMP (Linux, Apache HTTP Server, MySQL, and PHP, Perl or Python) (Wikipedia, 2013)
- MAMP (Macintosh, Apache, MySQL and PHP) (MAMP, 2007)
- WAMP (Windows Apache MySQL PHP) (Bourdon, 2013)
- XAMMP (Cross-platform Apache MySQL PHP) (Seidler, 2013)

With dozens of vulnerabilities and hints to help the user, Mutillidae is an easy-to-use web hacking environment designed for labs, security enthusiast, classrooms, CTF, and vulnerability assessment tool targets. Recent enhancements include an augmented version of Damn Vulnerable Web Services (DVWS) (Johnson, Damn Vulnerable Web Services, 2011).

Mutillidae has been employed for several use-cases:

- Graduate security courses\(^5\) (Jeffrey L. Hieb, 2013)
- Corporate training\(^6\)
- Web pen-testing training courses (SANS\(^\text{TM}\) Institute, 2013) (SANS\(^\text{TM}\) Institute, 2013)
- An "assess the assessor" target for vulnerability assessment software (Druin, 2011)
- Target for Web Application Firewall (WAF) testing (McHenry, 2013)
- Demonstration platform in presentations for the Open Web Applications Security Project (OWASP) Chapters (Blankenship, Hartmann, Koenig, Baso, & Sullivan, 2013) and Information

\(^1\) Mutillidae are sometimes known as “wingless wasps”. Mutillidae, a web application security project (wasp) built deliberately without security can be thought as having its wings clipped. Credit to Adrian “irongeek” Crenshaw for the name.

\(^2\) Distributions verified include Backtrack 5 R3, Kali, and Ubuntu

\(^3\) Distributions verified include XP, Vista, and 7

\(^4\) Mac OSX “Snow Leopard” is verified to run the project successfully on MAMP (Macintosh, Apache, MySQL and PHP).

\(^5\) University of Louisville Speed Scientific School

\(^6\) Multinational logistics company
2. Project History

Mutillidae began as version 1.x on irongeek.com (Crenshaw, Irongeek.com, 2013) as a web pen testing target for vulnerabilities in the OWASP Top 10. Version 1.x was created by Adrian “irongeek” Crenshaw (Crenshaw, Irongeek.com, 2009). Although version 1.x is no longer supported or actively developed, it is still available today (Crenshaw, Mutillidae-classic (Mutillidae versions 1.x), 2012). Rather than augment version 1.x, a new project, Mutillidae II, was written using object oriented architecture. The available functionality was ported. An expanded feature set and new classes of vulnerabilities were added.

The redesign and development of Mutillidae 2.x was completed by Jeremy Druin who migrated both projects from irongeek.com to SourceForge (Druin, SourceForge: Mutillidae 2.x Download (Current Version), 2013). This aided in scaling distribution and consolidating documentation. Mutillidae 2.x recalls its roots by re-implementing the OWASP 2010 Top 10 vulnerabilities and redesigning Crenshaw’s “user hint system”.
3. Advantages

Mutillidae has several advantages that make the system attractive for independent study and instructor-led training. These may be summarized as vulnerabilities/challenges, built-in user assistance, ease of installation, security levels, and automated set-up/recovery.

3.1. Vulnerabilities and Challenges Provided

The project delivers vulnerabilities, skill-challenges, and capture-the-flag support in an attempt to create a comprehensive web security training environment.

3.1.1. Vulnerabilities

Mutillidae implements a large variety of vulnerabilities with every category represented from the OWASP Top Ten 2007 (OWASP Foundation, 2010) and OWASP Top Ten 2010 (OWASP Foundation, 2010). Additionally several weaknesses from the SANS TOP 25 Most Dangerous Software Errors (SANS, 2011) are included. Currently there are 43 types of vulnerabilities put into operation across multiple perspectives (Druin, Documentation: Listing of Vulnerabilities in Mutillidae 2.x, 2013). For critical categories such as cross site scripting (KirstenS, 2011) and SQL injection (KirstenS, SQL Injection, 2013), multiple contexts have been implemented for each. Types of Cross-site scripting vulnerabilities provided include HTML, JavaScript, and JSON injection. Pages with SQL injection allow data extraction, upload of shells, and authentication bypass. A listing of vulnerabilities organized by URL is available (Druin, Documentation: Listing of Vulnerabilities in Mutillidae 2.x, 2013).

In contrast to some deliberately vulnerable web applications, Mutillidae contains “live” vulnerabilities. The user is not expected to enter statements which the platform matches against a list of correct answers. Although known solutions exist for each page, there is no particular solution required to achieve exploitation.

---

7 Specifically vulnerabilities related to web applications. The SANS TOP 25 Most Dangerous Software Errors additionally contains vulnerabilities from other types of “non-web” applications.
8 For a complete list see Appendix E: Types of Cross-site Scripting Vulnerabilities Implemented
9 For a complete list see Appendix F: Types of SQL Injection Vulnerabilities Implemented
10 For a complete listing of vulnerabilities in Mutillidae, refer to Appendix A.
For safety and legal reasons, ensure Mutillidae is only accessible via local host or over a closed virtual network and only to the intended audience\textsuperscript{11}.

### 3.1.2. Skill-Challenges

Several skill-challenges have been included in the latest edition\textsuperscript{12}. These may be helpful to explore hacking scenarios, use the platform for demonstrations, and prepare for security certification exams. A list of challenges currently implemented is listed in Appendix B\textsuperscript{13}.

#### 3.1.2.1. Privilege Escalation

To provide a web cryptography challenge, the “User Privileges” page\textsuperscript{14} has a CBC bit flipping vulnerability. This challenge provides the user the ability to escalate privileges by attacking the initialization vector (Druin, Mutillidae: Introduction to CBC bit flipping attack , 2012). Privilege escalation is also possible by altering the value of “cookies”.

#### 3.1.2.2. User-Agent Impersonation

In a simulation of “captive portals”, User-agent impersonation allows the user to spoof a Safari browser running on Apple iPad. By controlling the User-Agent string and custom settings, the user can appear as the target device and be accepted by the captive portal page\textsuperscript{15}.

#### 3.1.2.3. Authentication Bypass

Multiple methods of Authentication Bypass are possible

- Session hijacking and cookie tampering (Druin, Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication via Authentication Token Manipulation, 2012)

\textsuperscript{11} Mutillidae includes a default .htaccess file restricted to 127.0.0.1 (localhost) and 192.168.*.* in an effort to provide some default security but running the project on a production or networked host is strenuously discouraged.

\textsuperscript{12} Version 2.5.12 as of this writing

\textsuperscript{13} An updated list is maintained at http://sourceforge.net/projects/mutillidae/files/documentation/listing-of-vulnerabilities-in-mutillidae.txt/download

\textsuperscript{14} By default, when installed on localhost http://localhost/mutillidae/index.php?page=view-user-privilege-level.php

\textsuperscript{15} http://localhost/mutillidae/index.php?page=user-agent-impersonation.php
• SQL injection can be employed to become the administrative user or a user of the attackers choosing (Figure 1) (Druin, Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication using SQL Injection, 2012).

• Administrative pages may also be reached by brute forcing the page name\(^{16}\) (Druin, Mutillidae: Brute Force Page Names using Burp-Suite Intruder, 2012). Information disclosed in robot.txt\(^ {17}\) and directory browsing assists the user. (Druin, Mutillidae: Manual Directory Browsing to reveal Easter Egg File, 2012).

3.1.2.4. SSL Striping

The system includes an “Enforce SSL” feature which redirects HTTP requests to an HTTPS (SSL) connection (Druin, Mutillidae: Using Ettercap and SSLstrip to Capture Credentials, 2012). This gives an opportunity to perform “machine in the middle” (MITM) attacks with SSL Stripping (Marlinspike, 2012) to downgrade the target connection. The web browsing session proceeds in clear-text through the attacking host.

3.1.3. “Capture the flag” support

In addition to the variety of vulnerabilities implemented, Mutillidae provides specialized features to support “capture the flag” competitions and practice using popular web application security tools.

3.1.3.1. Automated Data Capture

By forced redirection, browser “hooking”, or social engineering a user can be forced to visit the capture-data.php page. The user’s cookies, all request parameters (GET and POST), client IP address and user-agent string will automatically be parsed into a database table\(^ {18}\) and written to a text file\(^ {19}\). To support the attacker, the captured-data.php page organizes captured data into time-stamped records shown on a grid (Figure 2).

---


\(^ {18}\) Assuming default database, the table is nowasp.captured-data

\(^ {19}\) <web root>/mutillidae/captured-data.txt
3.1.3.2. Vulnerabilities Geared Towards Attack Tools

Additionally, certain pages contain vulnerabilities crafted to respond to tools commonly used in labs, classes, and competitions\(^{20}\). Cross-site scripting is implemented as persistent vulnerabilities to allow the user to practice writing the exploit and lay traps such as redirection scripts, Beef Exploitation Framework (BeEF) hooks (BeEF Project), and scripts which use Asynchronous JavaScript and XML (AJAX) “background requests” (Refsnes Data, 2013) to avoid detection.

The following attack tools and web pen testing distributions are supported:

- sqlmap Automatic SQL injection and database takeover tool (Stampar & Damele): SQL injection opportunities that do not require prefixes and suffixes are provided (Druin, Basics of using sqlmap - ISSA KY Workshop - February 2013, 2013).
- Nikto 2 web server scanner (Sullo & Lodge, 2010)
- Burp-Suite security testing platform (PortSwigger Ltd., 2013)
- Web Application Attack and Audit Framework (w3af) (Riancho, 2013)
- NetSparker Community web application security scanner (Mavituna Security Ltd.)

---

\(^{20}\) The user may choose to exploit these vulnerabilities without the toolsets
• Cenzic Hailstorm web application vulnerability scanner (Cenzic, Inc.)
• sslstrip HTTPS stripping attack tool (Marlinspike, 2012)
• hydra network logon cracker (van Hauser, 2013)
• OWASP DirBuster (Fisher, 2009)
• Samurai WTF (Johnson, Searle, & DiMaggio, Samurai Web Testing Framework, 2008)
• Rapid 7 Metasploitable 2 (Moore, 2012)
• Offensive Security Kali Linux penetration testing distribution (Offensive Security, 2013)

3.2. Help

The project contains 2 types of built-in user assistance on each page of the site plus external assistance.

• Dynamic help system
• Bubble hints
• Easter egg file
• Video tutorials

3.2.1. Built-in User Assistance

A hints system offers two levels of assistance. By default no hints are displayed\(^{21}\). Clicking the “Toggle Hints” button on the menu bar (Figure 3) activates level-1 hints. Upon clicking again, hints level-2 is actuated. Level-1 hints provide dynamically generated boxes which can be opened to provide information on the vulnerabilities in the page (Figure 3). Sections included are general description, discovery, and exploitation. Level-2 hints provide full tutorials on the subject matter.

See Appendix G for a list of topics covered by the level-1 hint system.

\(^{21}\) The system defaults to hint-level 0. Hint levels 1 and 2 provide increasing amounts of assistance.
Figure 3: Clicking “Toggle Hints” activates embedded tutorials for the user. In this screenshot, Level 1 hints have been activated. The Cross Site Request Forgery hint is open for viewing.

Besides the written hints, the system will display pop-up “bubbles” when the user hovers over vulnerable areas on the page. The bubbles appear in all hint levels; however, the text displayed becomes more revealing as the hint level increases. Bubble hints can be disabled. The system will hide both bubble hints and dynamic help sections in the highest security level.

An Easter egg file “hidden” in the documentation directory contains several hundred lines of exploit code verified to work on various pages. Besides providing “known-good” exploits, the scripts can act as stubs to write injections.

3.2.2. Video Tutorial Support

Video tutorials are available (Druin, webpwnized's channel, 2013) demonstrating discovery, testing, and exploiting vulnerabilities. New videos are added periodically and there are approximately 80 videos at the time of this writing. (Druin, Query Results for Mutillidae on webpwnized channel, 2013).

---

22 This feature requires JavaScript to be enabled since bubble hints are activated on mouse-over.
23 The Show/Hide Bubble Hint toggle is located on the main menu bar (Figure 3)
24 <webroot>/documentation
25 Mutillidae-Test-Scripts.txt
Both YouTube and SourceForge allow “subscriptions” which can send an email when material is posted (SourceForge, 2013). If a single location to follow both areas is desired, announcements for both the project and videos are tweeted from a Twitter account (Druin, @webpwnized, 2013).

For a listing of videos available, see Appendix D.

3.3. Other Features

Mutillidae II implements automated system recovery to assist users in returning the backend database to the default state. Additionally, the user can switch between 3 security levels which range from completely vulnerable to secure.

3.3.1. Automated System Recovery

When the “Reset Database” button is clicked, the system will drop the backend database then rebuild the database, tables, and pre-configured target data. This restores the system to its original state with the exception of the current security level and “help” level (Figure 4). These two items are stored in the session and remain intact until the user closes the browser.

---

26 The primary channel is the “webpwnized” YouTube channel (http://www.youtube.com/user/webpwnized/videos). Irongeek.com mirrors most videos (Crenshaw, Web Application Pen-testing Tutorials With Mutillidae, 2013).

27 The database reset button is located on the main menu bar (Figure 3)

28 A listing of tables is provided in Appendix B
3.3.1.1. Automated System Recovery

The system restore feature is useful anytime a fresh start is desired but was created with two primary use-cases in mind.

Performing labs will change the system endangering the success of the next exercise. The restore feature ensures each lab starts from the same “clean” state.

Users may successfully exploit the system. “Persistent” malicious injections alter the system resulting in instability or annoyances. (Consider a series of popup boxes injected via cross site scripting vulnerabilities). The restore feature will drop persistent injections.

3.3.2. Security Levels

By default, Mutillidae runs insecure code but the system contains three code bases. The “security level” determines which application code executes when the user visits a page. The user can escalate from the
most insecure mode to fully secure\textsuperscript{29}. Additionally, there is an intermediate security level\textsuperscript{30} similar to the default mode except that JavaScript validation is activated in several pages. In this mode, the user is expected to bypass the validation\textsuperscript{31}.

The source code, including secure and insecure modes for each page, is stored in the same PHP file for easy comparison\textsuperscript{32}. At the top of each page, variables are set which drive the page behavior.

### 3.4. Ease of Installation / Standard Architecture

Mutillidae may be installed on Linux and Windows hosts via SVN, Git or manually. It is available pre-installed on a few Linux “live” distributions. Installation steps are discussed later.

By running on Apache, MySQL, PHP (AMP) stacks the project will work well on both Linux and Windows hosts. Using a three-tier architecture (web server, application server, and database), the system is implemented in PHP Hypertext Preprocessor (PHP) scripts. A complete listing of database tables and columns can be found in Appendix C.

A central page, index.php\textsuperscript{33}, provides a common header, menu, frame, and footer for all other pages. Page content indicated by the “page” parameters is loaded into the center frame\textsuperscript{34}.

\textsuperscript{29} Security level 0 is insecure. Security level 5 is secure as of this writing. Newly discovered vulnerabilities in security level 5 should be reported at [http://sourceforge.net/p/mutillidae/bugs/](http://sourceforge.net/p/mutillidae/bugs/).

\textsuperscript{30} Security level 1 implements JavaScript validation on some pages and provides an alternative puzzle on the CBC bit flipping challenge.

\textsuperscript{31} Using an interception proxy such as Burp-Suite is consider best practice but disabling JavaScript works in many cases.

\textsuperscript{32} The source code may be viewed at [http://sourceforge.net/p/mutillidae/code/](http://sourceforge.net/p/mutillidae/code/).

\textsuperscript{33} Assuming the project is installed on localhost, [http://localhost/mutillidae/index.php](http://localhost/mutillidae/index.php)

\textsuperscript{34} This creates an Insecure Direct Object Reference vulnerability.
4. Usage

4.1. Installation

4.1.1. Installation on Windows

Mutillidae can be installed by copying a single folder into an Apache-MySQL-PHP (AMP) installation. For Window XP/7, Cross-platform Apache MySQL PHP (XAMPP) (Seidler, 2013) is the default platform. XAMPP is extensively tested and known to work well; however, Mutillidae is also confirmed to operate on Windows Apache MySQL PHP (WAMP) (Bourdon, 2013). An instructional video is available to assist with installation on Windows (Druin, Mutillidae: Installing OWASP Mutillidae II on Windows with XAMPP, 2012). Please see installation steps below.

4.1.2. Installation on Linux

Mutillidae will run on Linux, Apache HTTP Server, MySQL, and PHP (LAMP) (Wikipedia, 2013) stacks on Ubuntu. While not officially supported, Mutillidae also functions on Macintosh, Apache, MySQL and PHP (MAMP) (MAMP, 2007).

4.1.3. Installation Steps

- Acquired the project using one of the following options
  - Download the compressed “ZIP” file\(^{35}\)
  - Subversion (SVN) (CollabNet, Inc., 2013)\(^{36}\)
  - Git (git, 2013)\(^{37}\)
- The entire project is contained within the folder “mutillidae”
- Place the folder into the “web server root directory”. The web root for the various AMP platforms varies\(^{38}\).
- Browse to the application at http://<domain>/mutillidae

\(^{35}\) http://sourceforge.net/projects/mutillidae/files/mutillidae-project/
\(^{36}\) svn checkout svn://svn.code.sf.net/p/mutillidae/code/ mutillidae
\(^{37}\) git clone git://git.code.sf.net/p/mutillidae/git mutillidae
\(^{38}\) By default, the webroot for XAMPP is C:\xampp\htdocs\. LAMP webroot is often found at /var/www/.
• Click the “Reset DB” (reset database) button to have the database tables automatically provisioned and populated with target data. In addition to creating the application tables, the database script attempts to determine if the MySQL server is available.
• A warning will be issued to the user if the database appears to be offline.39

4.1.4. Preinstalled on Well-known distributions

Installation provides the greatest flexibility but Mutillidae comes preinstalled on three popular platforms. These include

• Rapid7 Metasploitable 2 (Moore, 2012)
• OWASP Broken Web Apps (OWASP BWA) (Willis, 2012).

These platforms will necessarily have the version of Mutillidae available at the time they were published but the project can be updated by replacing the existing files with the current files.

Samurai-WTF version 2 (InGuardians Labs, Sawyer, Searle, Johnson, & Siles, 2012), a ready-to-use bootable ISO, has a particularly low entry barrier because this platform has both the Mutillidae project plus other excellent deliberately vulnerable web application like Damn Vulnerable Web Application (DVWA) (RandomStorm, 2013) included. Additionally, many tools used in the course of web pen testing are installed (Klein Keane, 2001) (McRee, 2010).

Live distributions have advantages such as being pre-built and avoiding changes to the host hard drive40. Each of the distributions comes with the version of Mutillidae available at the time the distribution is created, but videos are available which explain how to upgrade the project to the latest version on Samurai-WTF.

---
39 The default username/password assumed for the MySQL server is root:<blank>. Upon MySQL authentication failure, the script will attempt to use root:samurai. “samurai” is the MySQL password on Samurai-WTF.
40 Live distributions such as Samurai-WTF and Kali Live-System run entirely in RAM unless made “persistent”
• Mutillidae: How to Upgrade to the Latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0 (Druin, Mutillidae: How to Upgrade to the Latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0, 2012)
• Mutillidae: How to install latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0 (Druin, Mutillidae: How to install latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0, 2012)

4.2. Mutillidae in action

4.2.1. Selecting an Exercise

Lab exercise are organized by the OWASP Top Ten. For example, selecting the “User Info" page from the menu will load the “User Information” page (Figure 5).

Figure 5: Selecting “OWASP Top 10” -> “A1 – SQL Injection” -> “SQLi – Extract Data” -> “User Info” will direct the user to the “User Information” page

41 “OWASP Top 10” -> “A1 – SQL Injection” -> “SQLi – Extract Data” -> “User Info"
42 Assuming default installation the “User Information” page is located at http://localhost/mutillidae/index.php?page=user-info.php
This page displays an account’s profile if the user enters the username and password of the account wanted. Assuming the security level is set to “zero” or “one”, the page contains a defect which results in a Structured Query Language (SQL)\(^{43}\) injection vulnerability.

Users are reminded to “reset” between exercises.

### 4.2.2. Basic Example

SQL injection can be performed quickly by activating the hints, inserting the example provided into the “username” field, and clicking the “Lookup User” button. The hint is provided by opening the “SQL Injection” hint and referring to the section on “Exploitation” (Figure 6).

The SQL injection will result in the display of all accounts (Figure 7).

---

\(^{43}\) Structured Query Language (SQL) - http://www.w3schools.com/sql/
4.2.3. Intermediate Example

To perform an SQL injection following the map-discover-exploit methodology:

1. Induce an error to reveal internal page structure and/or logic
2. Determine SQL fragments needed to form a syntactically correct SQL statement
3. Encode the fragments in order to create a valid injection
4. Inject the fragment into the vulnerable input parameter

This process begins by injecting characters which are meaningful within an SQL query such as single-quote, block-open-comment (/*), inline-comment (--), or others (Oracle, 2013). This will cause the system to throw an exception when attempting to pull account information. Because the page exhibits an "application exception information leakage" vulnerability, specifically an “SQL disclosure” defect, internal system information such as the database query is displayed (Whalen, Khant, & KirstenS, 2013).

In version 2.5.8, this query is the following where “username submitted” and “password submitted” are the form values passed by the user.

Figure 7: Result of SQL Injection using Built-in help
If the user only wishes to dump all accounts, they can use the information gained to alter the query by passing not only data but also SQL query syntax that completes the query such that the query will always evaluate to TRUE despite the “WHERE” clause (refer to example query above). One solution would be to pass the following as the “username” form value. The value of the password form field is not relevant in this example. As a placeholder, a value of “anything” might be passed. Note carefully that there is a space at the end of the statement.

```
Username: ' or 'r' = 'r' --
Password: <not relevant> (example uses the string “anything”)
```

When the user injection is combined with the SQL supplied by the system, the resulting statement would be:

```
SELECT * FROM accounts WHERE username='' or 'r' = 'r' -- AND password='anything'
```

With the comment symbol cancelling the password portion of the query and the username always resulting to TRUE regardless (since the letter “r” is always equal to itself), the effective SQL statement executed is equivalent to:

```
SELECT * FROM accounts
```

As such the system will display all records from the accounts table (Figure 8).

Because Mutillidae is genuinely vulnerable\(^{44}\), more realistic exercises may be carried out. In some cases instructors will want to see a complete discovery phase combined with methodical injections.

\(^{44}\) The user is not expected to enter a predetermined sequence of characters
4.2.4. Advanced Example

SQL Injection is capable of reading and writing files when preconditions are met\(^{45}\). Building on the “Intermediate Example”, a “union” type SQL injection can read files hosted on the database server using database functionality. For example, MySQL includes the LOAD_FILE() function (Oracle Corporation, 2013). Union type SQL injection allows the web application query to run with a query injected by the attacker\(^ {46}\).

**Username:** ' union select null, null, LOAD_FILE('..../../../etc/passwd') AS username, null, null--

**Password:** <not relevant> (example uses the string “anything”)

When the user injection is combined with the SQL supplied by the system, the resulting statement is:

```sql
SELECT * FROM accounts WHERE username=
'union select null, null,
LOAD_FILE('..../../../etc/passwd') AS username, null, null--
AND password='anything'
```

The LOAD_FILE() function reads the contents of /etc/passwd\(^ {47}\) file which are displayed by the web application (Figure 9).

---

\(^{45}\) The database account used by the web application need permissions to read/write files to the operating system

\(^ {46}\) Technically both queries are sub-queries of the union

\(^ {47}\) On Windows systems, boot.ini may provide a good test target
SQL injection is an interesting example but uses only two vulnerabilities. As noted previously, a complete listing of vulnerabilities is listed in Appendix A.
5. Conclusion

With secure coding training and security awareness becoming increasingly important portions of a security program, deliberately vulnerable web applications can provide a target on which to practice application security. The Mutillidae web pen testing system presents web, application, web service and database vulnerabilities from the OWASP Top Ten and SANS Top 25 through which exploits and remediation can be performed safely and legally.

Very few target platforms expose a large variety of vulnerabilities in a single system; especially the inclusion of web services. By incorporating these into one system, Mutillidae offers a superior product suitable to prepare for certification exams and master concepts learned in training.

Since the application can be installed relatively easily, operates on both Linux and Windows, and does not require programming experience to operate there is a low barrier to entry. Mutillidae includes hints and tutorials allowing the system to be used in a classroom environment, independent study, or instructor-led training courses. The automated setup and recovery feature provides reproducible results from a known-good state. These features and others make Mutillidae a good candidate to consider using in web application security programs.
Appendix A: Listing of Vulnerabilities (as of July 31, 2013)\textsuperscript{48}

- SQL Injection
- O/S Command injection
- JSON injection
- HTML injection
- JavaScript Injection
- DOM injection
- Cascading style sheet injection
- Log injection
- Reflected Cross Site Scripting via GET, POST, Cookies, and HTTP Headers
- Stored Cross Site Scripting
- Cross Site Request Forgery
- Authentication Bypass via SQL injection
- Privilege Escalation via Cookie Injection
- Unencrypted database credentials
- Directory Browsing
- JavaScript validation bypass
- Remote File Inclusion
- Frame source injection
- PHPMyAdmin Console
- SSL Stripping
- Application Exception
- Un-validated Redirects and Forwards
- Phishing
- Click-jacking
- CBC bit flipping (latest)
- Brute force “secret admin pages”
- PHP server configuration disclosure

\textsuperscript{48} For the latest list: http://sourceforge.net/projects/mutillidae/files/documentation/listing-of-vulnerabilities-in-mutillidae.txt/download
- Application path disclosure
- Platform path disclosure
- Information disclosure via HTML comments
- robots.txt information disclosure
- Parameter addition
- HTTP Parameter Pollution
- Buffer overflow
- Denial of Service
- Loading of any arbitrary file
- Method Tampering
- Forms caching
- Local File Inclusion
- Comments with sensitive data
- Insecure Cookies
- XML External Entity Injection
- Unrestricted File Upload
Appendix B: Listing of Challenges

- Authentication bypass
- Brute forcing secret administrative pages
- CBC bit flipping
- Privilege escalation
- SSL Stripping
- User agent impersonation
Appendix C: Database Structure

Default database name: (Can be changed by user)

Tables, columns:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Columns</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>blogs_table</td>
<td>cid, blogger_name, comment, date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>accounts</td>
<td>cid, username, password, mysignature, is_admin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>hitlog</td>
<td>cid, hostname, ip, browser, referrer, date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>credit_cards</td>
<td>ccid, ccnumber, ccv, expiration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pen_test_tools</td>
<td>tool_id, tool_name, phase_to_use, tool_type, comment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>captured_data</td>
<td>data_id, ip_address, hostname, port</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
user_agent_string
deferrer
data
capture_date

page_hints
  page_name
  hint_key
  hint

page_help
  page_name
  help_text_key
  order_preference

level_1_help_include_files
  level_1_help_include_file_key
  level_1_help_include_file

balloon_tips
  tip_key
  hint_level
  tip
# Appendix D: Listing of Video Tutorials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic</th>
<th>Video</th>
<th>URL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Installation</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Installing OWASP Mutillidae II on Windows with XAMPP</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1hF0Q6ihvjc">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1hF0Q6ihvjc</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Installing Metasploitable-2 with Mutillidae on Virtual Box</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e0vpBKRZPGc">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e0vpBKRZPGc</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: How to install latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y-Cz3YRNe9U">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=y-Cz3YRNe9U</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to Installing, Configuring, and Using Burp-Suite Proxy</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=L4un5IppoY4">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=L4un5IppoY4</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: How to install and configure Burp-Suite with Firefox</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Fj0n17Jtnzw">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Fj0n17Jtnzw</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: How to remove PHP errors after installing Mutillidae on Windows XAMPP</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kDo52RySRME">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kDo52RySRME</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building a Virtual Lab to Practice Pen Testing</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5egBx15Nnwo">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5egBx15Nnwo</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: How to Upgrade to the Latest Mutillidae on Samurai WTF 2.0</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=obOLDQ-66oQ">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=obOLDQ-66oQ</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tools and Techniques</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Spidering Web Applications with Burp-Suite</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=P52EuH9MnTs">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=P52EuH9MnTs</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of Burp-Suite Targets Tab</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q3iG7YMjemE">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=q3iG7YMjemE</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Using Burp Intruder Sniper to Fuzz Parameters</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=la5hTISDKWg">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=la5hTISDKWg</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Comparing Burp-Suite Intruder Modes Sniper, Battering-ram, Pitchfork, Cluster-bomb</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2Ehp33BLRml">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=2Ehp33BLRml</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to Burp-Suite Comparer Tool</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KxqY_bp13gc">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KxqY_bp13gc</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Using Burp-Suite Sequencer to Compare CSRF-token strengths</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YGRoFU0USRA">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YGRoFU0USRA</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of Web Request and Response Interception with Burp-Suite</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qsE04AhJrc">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=qsE04AhJrc</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ISSA 2013 Web Pen-testing Workshop - Part 1 - Intro to Mutillidae, Burp Suite &amp; Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Jp2YtgJm8Q">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Jp2YtgJm8Q</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Overview of Useful Pen Testing Add-ons for Firefox</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ld_JC3hJzhk">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=ld_JC3hJzhk</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### OWASP 2013 A1: Injection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SQL Injection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication using SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Automate SQL Injection using sqlmap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of SQL Injection Timing Attacks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to Union-Based SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of Inserting Data with SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Inject Web Shell Backdoor via SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of using SQL Injection to Read Files</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Generate Cross Site Scripts with SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: SQL Injection via AJAX request with JSON response</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### OWASP 2013 A3: Cross-site Scripting

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Cross-site Scripting</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Explanation of HTTPOnly Cookies in Presence Cross-Site Scripting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Two Methods to Steal Session Token using Cross-Site Scripting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Injecting a Cross Site Script via Cascading Stylesheet Context</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Basics of Injecting Cross-Site Script into HTML onclick Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to locating Reflected Cross-site Scripting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Sending Persistent Cross-site Scripts into Web Logs to Snag Web Admin</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Generate Cross Site Scripts with SQL Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Injecting Cross Site Scripts (XSS) into Log Page via Cookie</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction to HTML Injection (HTMLi) and Cross Site Scripting (XSS) Using Mutillidae</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to Cross Site Scripting (XSS) via JavaScript String Injection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Explanation of HTTPOnly Cookies in Presence Cross-Site Scripting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

49 (Smithline & Gigler, Top 10 2013-A1-Injection, 2013)

50 (Smithline, Wichers, Wetter, & Gigler, 2013)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OWASP 2013 A6&lt;sup&gt;51&lt;/sup&gt;: Sensitive Data Disclosure HTML5 Web Storage</th>
<th>Mutillidae: Adding Values to DOM Storage using Cross-site Scripting</th>
<th><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uJoMHujjo_I">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=uJoMHujjo_I</a></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Alter Values in HTML5 Web Storage using Cross-site Script</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=N1-Fxp7WrC4">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=N1-Fxp7WrC4</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Alter Values in HTML5 Web Storage using Persistent Cross-site Script</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=F4t9XfTAsJk">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=F4t9XfTAsJk</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Alter Values in HTML5 Web Storage using Reflected Cross-site Script</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=luMyYV70bk4">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=luMyYV70bk4</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web Pen Testing HTML 5 Web Storage using JSON Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MNvAib9KWzo">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MNvAib9KWzo</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Stealing HTML5 Storage via JSON Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tGcZKBXsFU">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tGcZKBXsFU</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Reading Hidden Values from HTML5 Dom Storage</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3nAqRp9wt8g">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3nAqRp9wt8g</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OWASP 2013 A1: Injection&lt;sup&gt;52&lt;/sup&gt; Command Injection</th>
<th>Mutillidae: Command Injection to Dump Files, Start Services, and Disable Firewall</th>
<th><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1hXTq_qaa_U">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1hXTq_qaa_U</a></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: How to Locate the Easter egg File using Command Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VWZYyH0VewQ">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VWZYyH0VewQ</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Gaining Administrative Shell Access via Command Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GRuRK-bejgM">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=GRuRK-bejgM</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Using Command Injection to Gain Remote Desktop</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=if17nCdQfMg">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=if17nCdQfMg</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| OWASP 2013 A1: Injection<sup>53</sup> HTTP Parameter Pollution | Mutillidae: Introduction to HTTP Parameter Pollution | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Tosp-JyWVS4 |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OWASP 2013 A2: Broken Authentication and Session Management&lt;sup&gt;54&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
<th>Mutillidae: Using Hydra to Brute Force Web Forms Based Authentication</th>
<th><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SsUfUyizhS60">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SsUfUyizhS60</a></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication using SQL Injection</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0_AN5FKKxaw">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=0_AN5FKKxaw</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication via Authentication Token Manipulation</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mEmturLjJU">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mEmturLjJU</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Analyze Session Token Randomness using Burp-Suite Sequencer</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kNSAhKiXctA">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kNSAhKiXctA</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

<sup>51</sup> (Gigler & Smithline, 2013)  
<sup>52</sup> (Smithline & Gigler, Top 10 2013-A1-Injection, 2013)  
<sup>53</sup> (Smithline & Gigler, Top 10 2013-A1-Injection, 2013)  
<sup>54</sup> (Gigler & Smithline, Top 10 2013-A2-Broken Authentication and Session Management, 2013)
| OWASP 2013 A6\(^{55}\): Sensitive Data Disclosure | Mutillidae: Determine Server Banners using Netcat, Nikto, and w3af | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=goCm1TCJ29g |
| Local File Inclusion | Mutillidae: How to Exploit Local File Inclusion Vulnerability using Burp-Suite | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=t8w6Bd5zbU |
| Bypassing Client Restrictions | Mutillidae: Two Methods to Bypass JavaScript Validation | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e0M-qJYhCnk |
| Mutillidae: XSS bypassing JavaScript Validation | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9EaNr_8D65A |
| Mutillidae: How to Bypass Maxlength Restrictions on HTML Input Fields | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mjeBPCGA7ko |
| OWASP A5: Security Misconfiguration \(^{56}\) CBC Bit Flipping | Mutillidae: Introduction to CBC Bit Flipping Attack | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=TNT2rJcxdyg |
| OWASP A5: Security Misconfiguration \(^{57}\) SSL Stripping | Mutillidae: Using Ettercap and SSLstrip to Capture Credentials | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n_5NGkOnr7Q |
| ISSA KY September 2013 Workshop - Introduction to XML External Entity Injection | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Zl8U2YVp2lw |

\(^{55}\) (Gigler & Smithline, 2013)
\(^{56}\) (Gigler & Smithline, Top 10 2013-A5-Security Misconfiguration, 2013)
\(^{57}\) (Gigler & Smithline, Top 10 2013-A5-Security Misconfiguration, 2013)
\(^{58}\) (Smithline & Gigler, Top 10 2013-A1-Injection, 2013)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Netcat</th>
<th>ch?v=MxiVx7e_FbM</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Examination of Cache-Control and Pragma no-cache Headers</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=awMpx8Bhir0">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=awMpx8Bhir0</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Demonstration of Frame-busting JavaScript and X-Frame-Options Header</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KWcckqnUGo8">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KWcckqnUGo8</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Three Methods for Viewing HTTP Request and Response Headers</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NkdtMiUG30A">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=NkdtMiUG30A</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mutillidae: Introduction to User-agent Impersonation</td>
<td><a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VAGG4uC1ogw">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VAGG4uC1ogw</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Web Services | ISSA KY August 2013 Workshop - Introduction to Pen Testing Web Services | http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=e6HAQnvuaic |
Appendix E: Types of Cross-site Scripting Vulnerabilities Implemented

1. Hypertext Markup Language (HTML) (Druin, Introduction to HTML Injection (HTMLi) and Cross Site Scripting (XSS) Using Mutillidae, 2013)
2. JavaScript strings (Druin, Mutillidae: Introduction to Cross Site Scripting (XSS) via Javascript String Injection, 2013)
6. HTTP “cookies”/headers (Druin, Mutillidae: Injecting Cross Site Scripts (XSS) into Log Page via Cookie, 2012)
Appendix F: Types of SQL Injection Vulnerabilities Implemented

1. Extract data (Druin, Mutillidae: Introduction to union-based SQL Injection, 2012)
2. Bypass authentication (Druin, Mutillidae: Bypass Authentication using SQL Injection, 2012)
Appendix G: Built-in Help Topics

- Html5 Web Storage
- Unrestricted File Upload
- JSON Injection
- SQL Injection
- Html Injection
- Cross Site Scripting
- Cross Site Request Forgery
- Xml External Entity Attack
- Authentication Bypass
- JavaScript Injection
- Command Injection
- Local File Inclusion
- Insecure Direct Object Reference
- CBC Bit Flipping Attack
- Unvalidated Redirects And Forwards
- SSL Misconfiguration
- Cascading Style Sheet Injection
- Buffer Overflow
- Click Jacking
- Parameter Addition
- Dom Injection
- Secret Administrative Pages
- Parameter Pollution
- Method Tampering
- Information Disclosure
- JavaScript Validation Bypass
- User Agent Impersonation
- Platform Path Disclosure
- Application Path Disclosure
- Directory Browsing
- Remote File Inclusion
- Frame Source Injection
- Robots.Txt
6. References


Jeffrey L. Hieb, P. (2013, June 13). Assistant Professor, University of Louisville Speed-Scientific Department of Engineering Fundamentals. (J. Druin, Interviewer)


https://www.owasp.org/index.php/Education_Track:_What_Developers_Should_Know_on_Web_Application_Security


Upcoming SANS App Sec Training

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SANS 2020</td>
<td>Orlando, FL</td>
<td>Apr 03, 2020 - Apr 10, 2020</td>
<td>CyberCon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS Amsterdam May 2020</td>
<td>Amsterdam, Netherlands</td>
<td>May 11, 2020 - May 18, 2020</td>
<td>CyberCon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS Silicon Valley - Cupertino 2020</td>
<td>Cupertino, CA</td>
<td>Jun 22, 2020 - Jun 27, 2020</td>
<td>Live Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS Copenhagen August 2020</td>
<td>Copenhagen, Denmark</td>
<td>Aug 24, 2020 - Aug 29, 2020</td>
<td>Live Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS Network Security 2020</td>
<td>Las Vegas, NV</td>
<td>Sep 20, 2020 - Sep 27, 2020</td>
<td>Live Event</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS OnDemand</td>
<td>Online</td>
<td>Anytime</td>
<td>Self Paced</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SANS SelfStudy</td>
<td>Books &amp; MP3s Only</td>
<td>Anytime</td>
<td>Self Paced</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>